

# Plains CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction (PCOR) Partnership

Energy & Environmental Research Center (EERC)



## **REVIEW OF SOURCE ATTRIBUTES**

Plains CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction Partnership Phase III Task 1 – Deliverable D1

Prepared for:

Andrea Dunn

U.S. Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory 626 Cochrans Mill Road PO Box 10940 Pittsburgh, PA 15236-0940

DOE Cooperative Agreement No. DE-FC26-05NT42592

Prepared by:

Kyle A. Glazewski Justin T. Kovacevich Melanie D. Jensen Wesley D. Peck Charles D. Gorecki

Energy & Environmental Research Center University of North Dakota 15 North 23rd Street, Stop 9018 Grand Forks, ND 58202-9018

#### EERC DISCLAIMER

LEGAL NOTICE This research report was prepared by the Energy & Environmental Research Center (EERC), an agency of the University of North Dakota, as an account of work sponsored by the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE). Because of the research nature of the work performed, neither the EERC nor any of its employees makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement or recommendation by the EERC.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

This material is based upon work supported by the Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory under Award Number DE-FC26-05NT42592.

## **DOE DISCLAIMER**

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government, nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST	OF FIGURESi						
LIST	OF TABLESi						
NOM	IENCLATURE AND ABBREVIATIONSii						
EXECTIVE SUMMARYiii							
INTRODUCTION							
APPI	ROACH1						
RESULTS							
REF	REFERENCES						
	LIST OF FIGURES						
1	Location of the new facilities identified during this database update						
	LIST OF TABLES						
1	Summary of CO <sub>2</sub> from Point Sources Found Within the PCOR Partnership Region as of August 16, 2016						
2	Summary of CO <sub>2</sub> -Equivalent Emissions from Point Sources Found Within the PCOR Partnership Region as of August 16, 2016						
3	Summary of Non-CO <sub>2</sub> Greenhouse Gases Emitted by Sources in the PCOR Partnership Region						

## NOMENCLATURE AND ABBREVIATIONS

CH<sub>4</sub> methane

CO<sub>2</sub> carbon dioxide

CO<sub>2</sub>eq carbon dioxide equivalent
DOE U.S. Department of Energy
DSS Decision Support System

EPA U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

HFC hydrofluorocarbon

HFC-23 fluoroform N<sub>2</sub>O nitrous oxide

NATCARB National Carbon Sequestration Database and Geographic Information System

NO<sub>x</sub> nitrogen oxides

PCOR Plains CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction PFC perfluorocarbon

PFC-116 hexafluoroethane PFC-14 tetrafluoromethane

RCSPs Regional Carbon Sequestration Partnerships

SF<sub>6</sub> sulfur hexafluoride SO<sub>2</sub> sulfur dioxide



## **REVIEW OF SOURCE ATTRIBUTES**

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Plains CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction (PCOR) Partnership, led by the Energy & Environmental Research Center at the University of North Dakota, maintains a database of regional sources of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions and evaluates it on an annual basis. The database is an important part of assessing potential CO<sub>2</sub> capture–transportation–storage scenarios that could reduce greenhouse gas emissions in the PCOR Partnership region. The emission measurements compiled in this database are typically acquired through online databases of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and Environment Canada. The updated database shows that there are 394 significant (greater than 100,000 metric tons) CO<sub>2</sub> emission sources that emit 483 million tonnes on an annual basis.



## REVIEW OF SOURCE ATTRIBUTES

#### INTRODUCTION

The Plains CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction (PCOR) Partnership, led by the Energy & Environmental Research Center at the University of North Dakota, maintains a database of significant regional point sources of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>). The database is a key in the development of CO<sub>2</sub> capture–transportation–storage scenarios that have the potential to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in the PCOR Partnership region. To maintain a reasonably current status, the data set undergoes an annual review during which new or missing sources are identified and added, CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates are updated, and facility locations are verified. This report summarizes the data review that took place between September 8, 2015, and August 16, 2016.

#### **APPROACH**

Actual emission measurements are used whenever possible, but measured data are not always available for each of the sources. In cases where measured data are unavailable, emissions are estimated using the methodologies developed for the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) National Energy Technology Laboratory by the DOE Regional Carbon Sequestration Partnerships' (RCSPs') Capture and Transportation Working Group (Capture and Transportation Working Group of the DOE Regional Carbon Sequestration Partnerships, 2010). Web searches are used to acquire updated information regarding fuel type, heat content, and usage rate and/or product slate and quantities; these values are used to estimate CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates for specific sources.

Four data sets were used to update the PCOR Partnership's CO<sub>2</sub> emission database:

- The Environment Canada Reported Facility Greenhouse Gas Data (Environment Canada, 2016), an online greenhouse gas search engine, provides the annual emissions of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> (methane), N<sub>2</sub>O (nitrous oxide), SF<sub>6</sub> (sulfur hexafluoride), PFCs (perfluorocarbons), HFCs (hydrofluorocarbons), and other greenhouse gases for point sources from all sectors. The Canadian point sources in the PCOR Partnership database were updated using 2014 data (the most current data). The search engine can be accessed at www.ec.gc.ca/pdb/ghg/onlineData/dataSearch\_e.cfm.
- The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Air Markets Program Data online emission search engine (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2016a) provides CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub> (sulfur dioxide), and NO<sub>x</sub> emission data for electric utilities and larger industrial heat/power plants. The PCOR Partnership database was updated using facility data from

2015 so as to incorporate the most current data for these plants. This search engine can be accessed at http://ampd.epa.gov/ampd/.

• EPA's Greenhouse Gas Reporting Program Data for Calendar Year 2014 (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2016b) is a searchable site that contains CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O, CH<sub>4</sub>, PFC-14 (tetrafluoromethane), PFC-116 (hexafluoroethane), and HFC-23 (fluoroform) emission data reported from large facilities in nine industry groups: power plants, landfills, metal manufacturing, mineral production, petroleum refineries, pulp and paper manufacturing, chemical manufacturing, government and commercial facilities, and other industrial facilities. The Greenhouse Gas Reporting Program Data can be accessed at http://ghgdata.epa.gov/ghgp/main.do.

The EPA searchable database presents a challenge in that it is difficult to determine the total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions as opposed to the total CO<sub>2</sub> equivalent (CO<sub>2</sub>eq) emissions for some of the source types. One example of this is sugar-processing facilities with their inherent lime production. This is not true for all source types.

A final note about the use of the EPA database: the power plants are listed as producing CO<sub>2</sub> from both "stationary combustion" and "electricity generation." These values must be summed to produce the total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions at such sites.

The threshold for inclusion of the sources into the PCOR Partnership data has been set to 100,000 tonnes/yr. The threshold was chosen for several reasons:

- 100,000 tonnes/yr is generally thought to be the minimum emission level that would be useful to a commercial end user.
- The cost to capture and transport CO<sub>2</sub> from a system producing a smaller CO<sub>2</sub> stream than this would likely be prohibitively expensive.
- The other RCSPs have generally reported their CO<sub>2</sub> data for sources that produce at least 100,000 tonnes CO<sub>2</sub>/yr. This threshold puts the PCOR Partnership data set on the same basis as the other RCSP data sets within NATCARB (National Carbon Sequestration Database and Geographic Information System).

#### RESULTS

As of August 16, 2016, the updated PCOR Partnership database contains 394 sources that produce an estimated 483 million tonnes of CO<sub>2</sub> annually. The breakdown of the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by broad source category is presented in Table 1. The breakdown of the CO<sub>2</sub>eq emissions by broad source category is given in Table 2, while Table 3 shows the types and CO<sub>2</sub>eq of the other greenhouse gases emitted by the CO<sub>2</sub> sources tracked in the PCOR Partnership data set.

Figure 1 shows the locations of 13 new facilities that were found to be missing from the data set and were, therefore, added to it.

When available, the CO<sub>2</sub>eq emissions due to CH<sub>4</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O, HFCs, PFCs, and/or SF<sub>6</sub> are incorporated into the PCOR Partnership database. This information was found for as many as 302 (depending on the greenhouse gas) of the 394 sources and is summarized in Table 3. Roughly 76% of the large CO<sub>2</sub> point sources in the PCOR Partnership region emit other greenhouse gases in addition to CO<sub>2</sub>.

The process of moving this latest data set to the PCOR Partnership Decision Support System (DSS) is currently under way. When the process is complete, the updated emission data will be reflected via the online geographic information systems on the PCOR Partnership DSS and DOE's national portal.

Table 1. Summary of CO<sub>2</sub> from Point Sources Found Within the PCOR Partnership Region as of August 16, 2016

Total CO<sub>2</sub>, % of % of Category Count tonnes **Sources Emissions** Agricultural and Agriculture-**Related Processing** 20 1.3 6,224,049 5.1 **Electricity Generation** 131 319,122,996 33.2 66.1 Chemical and Fuel Production 23 14,990,659 5.8 3.1 **Ethanol Manufacture** 53 20,228,451 4.2 13.5 Cement/Clinker Production 21 18,067,045 5.3 3.7 Industrial 21 9,774,422 5.3 2.0 Small-Scale Heat and Power 11 2,528,177 2.8 0.5 Manufacturing 8 1,601,065 2.0 0.3 Petroleum- and Natural Gas-Related 84 80,459,325 21.3 16.7 Paper and Wood Products 19 9,144,660 4.8 1.9 **Waste Processing** 581,859 3 0.8 0.1 **Total** 394 482,722,706 100.0 100.0

Table 2. Summary of CO<sub>2</sub>-Equivalent Emissions from Point Sources Found Within the

PCOR Partnership Region as of August 16, 2016

		Total CO2eq,	% of	% of
Category	Count	tonnes	Sources	<b>Emissions</b>
Agricultural and Agriculture-				
Related Processing	20	6,882,711	5.1	1.4
Electricity Generation	131	319,641,971	33.2	65.3
Chemical and Fuel Production	23	16,112,038	5.8	3.3
Ethanol Manufacture	53	20,300,518	13.5	4.1
Cement/Clinker Production	21	18,130,670	5.3	3.7
Industrial	21	10,011,143	5.3	2.0
Small-Scale Heat and Power	11	2,542,637	2.8	0.5
Manufacturing	8	1,878,536	2.0	0.4
Petroleum- and Natural Gas-				
Related	84	83,690,428	21.3	17.1
Paper and Wood Products	19	9,492,614	4.8	1.9
Waste Processing	3	591,713	0.8	0.1
Total	394	489,274,981	100.0	100.0

Table 3. Summary of Non-CO<sub>2</sub> Greenhouse Gases Emitted by Sources in the PCOR

Partnership Region

Greenhouse		Number of	
Gas	CO <sub>2</sub> Equivalent Value	Sources	Quantity, tonnes CO2eq
CH <sub>4</sub>	21	302	3,945,291
$N_2O$	310	302	2,212,845
$SF_6$	23,900	5	1,728
HFC	140 to 11,700	6	3,645
PFC	6500 to 9200	2	273,927



Figure 1. Location of the new facilities identified during this database update.

## **REFERENCES**

Capture and Transportation Working Group of the DOE Regional Carbon Sequestration Partnerships, 2010, CO<sub>2</sub> point source emission estimation methodologies summary: Prepared for U.S. Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory Carbon Sequestration Program.

Environment Canada, 2016, Environment Canada reported facility greenhouse gas data: www.ec.gc.ca/pdb/ghg/onlineData/dataSearch\_e.cfm (accessed August 2016).

- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2016a, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency air markets program data for calendar year 2015: ampd.epa.gov/ampd/ (accessed August 2016).
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2016b, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency greenhouse gas reporting program data for calendar year 2014: ghgdata.epa.gov/ghgp/main.do (accessed August 2016).